

**Consideration of Withdrawal of Approval
 Cisco College in Abilene, Texas
 Associate Degree Nursing Education Program**

Summary of Request:

Consider the change of status for Cisco College Associate Degree Nursing (ADN) Education Program in Abilene, Texas, which has been on conditional approval status since April 2011, and staff recommendation based upon the 2011 NCLEX-RN® examination pass rate, review of the 2010 Nursing Education Program Information Survey (NEPIS), and the survey visit of November 1-2, 2011.

Historical Perspective:

Historical:

- The Associate Degree Nursing Education Program at Cisco College began as an LVN to RN Mobility Track in 1995.
- In July 2005, the Board granted initial approval to a new generic (two-year) ADN, and in 2009, the generic and mobility tracks were combined into one program.
- The following table presents a chronological overview of the NCLEX-RN® examination pass rate for the ADN program at Cisco since it began:

Examination Year	NCLEX Exam Score
2011	71.67% (43/60)
2010	78.26% (36/46)
2009 - Programs combined - one pass rate	78.26% (36/46)
2008 - Generic program had first pass rate	Generic: 57.89% (11/19); Mobility: 75.00% (21/28) Combined Pass Rate: 70.21% (33/47)
2007 - Mobility program only	86.84% (33/38)
2006	75.76% (25/33)
2005	93.15% (30/32)
2004	82.35% (28/34)
2003	82.05%
2002	75.00%
2001	82.80%
2000	70.00%
1999	95.50%
1998	100%
1997	75.00%
1996	89.50%

- The program's approval status was changed from Full with Warning to Conditional at the April 2011 Board meeting based upon the 2010 pass rate. With the change to conditional status, the Board restricted the program from admitting new students without Board approval.
- Board Staff intended to conduct a survey visit Fall 2010 but the nursing program director requested that the visit be postponed because the program was preparing for an accreditation visit from the National League for Nursing Accrediting Commission.
- Following the untimely death of their long-time director, Jackolyn Morgan, Cisco appointed Rose Caballero, MSN, RN, as Interim Director in August 2011.
- Board Staff conducted a survey visit on November 1-2, 2011 (See Attachment #1).

Pertinent Findings from Survey Visit:

- Board Staff had reviewed curriculum documents provided by the program prior to the visit.
- On November 1, 2011, Board Staff met with Interim Director Caballero and Chairs of other departments who provide support courses for the nursing program at Cisco College.
- On November 2, 2011, Board Staff and Board Member Deborah Bell met with administration, nursing faculty, and students in the ADN program.
- There are currently four (4) full time ADN nursing faculty and sixty-one (61) students enrolled in the program.
- The present cohort will graduate in May 2012.
- Faculty report that their workload is very heavy since they provide didactic instruction and clinical supervision of students in 12-hour shifts.
- The clinical learning experiences for the students involve direct patient care, observation experiences, and forms of simulation.
- The LVN to ADN students complete the program in one calendar year. They are required to take a transition course during the summer and merge with the generic (two-year) students for two semesters.
- The program is based upon an integrated approach where content and clinical experiences related to medical-surgical, pediatrics, mental health, and maternal health are combined in several nursing courses. An exception is a separate clinical course in mental health nursing in the generic program only.
- Students reported inconsistency in their evaluation by faculty for clinical experiences.
- Faculty files and student files that were reviewed were found to be incomplete and inconsistent.
- The faculty use test banks as well as ATI standardized examinations.

Meeting Between Board Staff and Cisco College Representatives:

On December 2, 2011 Board Staff met with representatives from Cisco College to discuss the status of the Associate Degree Nursing Program and possible Board action. The agenda for this meeting is included in Attachment #3. Cisco College provided a response letter to the BON following the meeting (See Attachment #4).

Rule 215.4(a)(5) states that "The Board may withdraw approval from a program which fails to meet legal and educational requirements within the specified time. The program shall be removed from the list of Board-approved professional nursing educational programs." Withdrawal of approval from a program would require that the program design a plan to teach-out the currently enrolled students or find placement for them in other nursing programs.

Pros of Withdrawal of Approval:

- The mission of the BON is to protect and promote the welfare of the people of Texas by ensuring that each person holding a license as a nurse in this state is competent to practice safely.
- The Board fulfills its mission through the regulation of the practice of nursing and the approval of nursing educational programs.
- Students and potential students of the program may be at risk for receiving an adequate educational preparation to practice safely.

Cons of Withdrawal of Approval:

- Withdrawal of approval affects the morale within an institution.

Staff Recommendation:

Board staff have proposed the following recommendation but seek Board counsel and discussion about the recommendation.

Based upon the history of the program of being on conditional approval since the 2011 NCLEX-RN® examination pass rate, the identification of areas of noncompliance with Rule 215, and consistent with the process described in Rule 215.4(a)(5), move to withdraw approval from Cisco College Associate Degree Nursing Education Program in Abilene, Texas, and to remove the name of the program from the list of Board-approved professional nursing education programs as stated in the attached letter (See Attachment #5).

**Summary of Survey Visit
Cisco College in Abilene, Texas
Associate Degree Nursing Program**

Purpose of Survey Visit: Focus visit related to approval status.

Date of Visit: November 1-2, 2011

Board Participants in Survey:

- Board Member Deborah Bell
- Board Staff Robin Caldwell, PhD, RN, CNLC

Board Staff reviewed curriculum materials provided by the program prior to the survey visit.

Board Staff met with:

- Rose Caballero, MSN, RN, Interim Director
- Division Chairs:
 - Heather Hicks, Chair of English and Foreign Languages
 - Amy Callan, Chair of Public Services
 - Randy Bolton, Chair of Humanities
 - Debbie Barton, Chair of Natural and Behavioral Sciences
 - Jerry Clemmons, Chair of Math

Board Staff and Board Member met with:

- Administration:
 - Dani Day, Vice President of Learning
 - Annette Smith, Dean of Instruction
 - Bobby Smith, President
 - Dr. Carol Dupree, Provost
 - Kelly Meyer, Chair of Allied Health
 - Randy Lee, Director of Counseling
- Faculty (4)
- Students

Board Staff and Board Member visited a nursing class in progress.

Board Staff toured the nursing facilities.

Findings:

Rose Caballero, MSN, RN, was appointed Interim Director in August, 2011, and has many years of experience in pre-licensure nursing education.

Administration:

Janice Hooper, PhD, RN joined the meeting with administration by conference call to provide information about the seriousness of the status of the nursing program to those attending the meeting. (See outline of script in Attachment #2). Administration voiced surprise about the situation and stated that the program is needed in the community.

Department Chairs:

The department chairs expressed that they felt ill-informed about the situation since the health of the nursing program affects other departments. Chairs expressed concerns of their frustration in having adequate authority to direct programs in the college and their awareness of the high turnover in nursing faculty.

Faculty:

- Four (4) full-time ADN faculty were interviewed.
- Faculty stated that they orient one another rather than use a formal process.
- One set of faculty minutes were reviewed from 2010, but others were not available.
- Faculty files reviewed were incomplete and inconsistent (missing CVs, information about faculty development, nursing licenses).
- Faculty have been teaching in the professional program for time periods ranging from six months to two years.
- Their frustrations as faculty center on the lack of leadership and disorganization in the department.
- Because of the number of students, faculty do not have time to schedule office hours and limited time to grade papers and prepare for classes. They must devote extended periods of time to clinical supervision because of competition among programs for clinical space.

Students:

- Sixty-one (61) students are presently enrolled in the program.
- Students stated that they little or not input into the governance of the nursing program.
- The LVN to ADN students voiced dissatisfaction with their education when compared to the generic students.
- The quality of the didactic and clinical varies, depending on the instructor. Students rely upon nurses in the clinical facilities to assist in their clinical learning.
- Students stated they only see the faculty in clinical settings for brief periods of time.
- Students complained of a lack of communication and support from administration.
- Admission criteria require only a GPA of 2.0 and prerequisites do not include rigorous science courses.
- Students expressed a lack of skill preparation in the skills lab prior to entering the clinical area for hands-on care.
- Students complained of a lack of consistency in how they are evaluated in clinical practice.

Program of Study:

- The philosophy and mission has not been revised since the program began in 1995.
- The program uses ATI but its effective use is not evident.
- The evaluation of students throughout the curriculum is not clear.
- The curriculum is an integrated format where course content and clinical experiences are a combination of medical-surgical, pediatric, mental health, and maternal-child nursing.

Clinical Learning Experiences:

- Clinical learning experiences are based upon 12-hour shifts related to the availability of clinical spaces.
- Results from employer surveys indicate that nursing students from Cisco College are weak in critical thinking and assessment skills.

Facilities, Resources, and Services:

- Facilities are in place to support the nursing program: classrooms, simulation labs, skills labs, and student support services.
- Faculty have private offices, lounges, and meeting spaces.

Total Program Evaluation:

- There was not evidence that the evaluation plan is being used in an ongoing manner.

Outline of Script for Conference Call with Administration at Cisco College, November 2, 2011

May we express our condolences for the loss of the previous director and the stress that such a trauma means to a program.

The meeting is not about the VN program which seems to be doing well. It is about the ADN program.

The ADN program was placed on conditional approval last April which meant no new students could be admitted.

The pass rate for 2011 is below 80% for a fourth year and the rule states that when this happens, the program's approval may be withdrawn.

In looking at the pass rates since the LVN and then ADN program began, about half the pass rates have been below 80%. When the generic began, the pass rate has never been 80% since then.

This report will be presented at the January Board meeting and the Board will make a decision at that meeting (January 19). Only the Board can make this decision. (I am Board staff. There are 13 Board members appointed by the Governor. Deborah is one of those members but she may recuse herself from the vote.)

Before such action is taken, we invite the program officials to the Board office to discuss the situation, and give the program an opportunity to respond to the proposed action. We will need to set a date in November or December. We will be contacting Rose with possible dates for this meeting.

If the Board decide to withdraw approval, the program must either find placement for the students in other nursing programs or teach the students through completion. There is the option for Cisco to reevaluate its nursing programs and if the decision is made, to develop a new program and seek approval from the BON. This is for the future.

We are meeting with you, faculty, and students to let you know the graveness of the situation. If you decide to teach out the students, we must discuss strategies to provide the strongest education and assistance to them that is possible so they can be successful on the NCLEX.

I understand that there are currently 61 students in the program.

**Texas Board of Nursing
Meeting with Cisco College Representatives
December 2, 2011, 1:00 PM
Hobby Building, Tower III, Suite 460**

Greeting and Introductions

Representatives from Cisco College:

- Mr. Ricky Whatley, Board Member
- Mr. Bobby Smith, President
- Mr. Jerry Dodson, Vice President of Student Services
- Ms. Annette Smith, Dean of Instruction
- Ms. Carol Dupree, Provost
- Ms. Audrey Baxter, MSN, RN, ADN Faculty Member, Contact Person for ADN Program, and Director of VN Program

Representatives from the Board of Nursing:

- Katherine Thomas, MN, RN, Executive Director
- Deborah Bell, Board Member
- James Johnston, General Counsel
- Mark Majek, Director of Operations
- Anthony Diggs, MSCJ, Director of Enforcement
- Janice I. Hooper, PhD, RN, Nursing Consultant for Education
- Virginia Ayars, EdD, MS, RN, Nursing Consultant for Education
- Robin Caldwell, PhD, RN, CLNC, Nursing Consultant for Education

Handouts Included:

- Rule 215.4 Approval
- Status Report of Program Approval
- Board Report of April 2011 with copy of letter submitted to Cisco College
- Board Report of April 2010 with copy of letter submitted to Cisco College
- Self Study Report from Cisco College ADN Program, May 2009

Summary of Program Approval Status

Summary of Survey Visit Report

Rule 215.4 Approval of Professional Nursing Education Programs
215.4(c)(3)(B) and (C)

Recommendation to the Board of Nursing at the January 19, 2012 Meeting

Responsibilities of the Program

215.3(d)(1) Closing a Program

Cisco College Response and Discussion

Questions

Adjournment



December 12, 2011

Janice Hooper, PhD, RN
Nursing Consultant for Education
Texas Board of Nursing
333 Guadalupe Street #-460
Austin, TX 78701

Dear Doctor Hooper:

The President, together with the faculty and staff of Cisco College want to express our commitment to achieving and maintaining a quality Associate Degree Nursing Program. We recognize that Board action to withdraw approval is part of a process that is rigorous and necessary.

Problems identified by the Board will be addressed and corrected, to the best of our ability, during the teach-out and final semester for our students. As stated in Rule 215.3(d), "The program will continue within standards until all students enrolled in the nursing educational program at the time of the decision to close, have graduated." We are dedicated to doing everything possible to ensure that this group graduates and successfully passes their Boards.

We expect to take what we have learned from this experience and use it to bring a new program proposal before the Board of Nursing that is supported by all elements of the college. Our goal is to demonstrate a level of transparency, cooperation and support that exemplifies the culture of our institution.

The mission of Cisco College is to provide high-quality learning opportunities that promote student success in an ever-changing global environment. We recognized that change can be a catalyst for greatness and we welcome the opportunity to grow and improve.

Sincerely,

Bobby Smith
President
254.442.5111

Annette Smith
Dean of Instruction
325.794.4439

Audrey Baxter
ADN Contact Person
325.794.4416

DRAFT LETTER

January 23, 2012

Audrey Baxter, MSN, RN
Associate Degree Nursing Program
Cisco College
717 East Industrial Boulevard
Abilene, TX 79602

Dear Ms. Baxter:

At the January 19-20, 2012 meeting, the Texas Board of Nursing discussed a change of approval status for Cisco College Associate Degree Nursing Education Program related to the persistent low NCLEX-RN® examination pass rates since 2008 and areas of noncompliance with Rule 215. The Board wishes to thank you and for being present to answer questions.

Rule 215.4(a)(5) states that "The Board may withdraw approval from a program which fails to meet legal and educational requirements within the specified time. The program shall be removed from the list of Board-approved professional nursing educational programs."

After much deliberation, the Board has decided to withdraw approval from Cisco College Associate Degree Nursing Program and to remove the program from the list of Board-approved professional nursing education programs effective immediately. Since this will constitute a closure of the Associate Degree Program, Cisco College is issued the following requirements:

Requirement No. 1: Cisco College shall make academic provisions for students to complete the nursing education program and teach-out arrangements have been approved by the appropriate agencies (i.e., Texas Workforce Commission, The Texas Higher Education Coordinating Board, Texas Board of Nursing).

Requirement No. 2: Cisco College shall make provisions for access to and safe storage of vital school records, including transcripts of all graduates.

Requirement No. 3: Cisco College shall ensure methods to be used to maintain requirements and standards until the program closes.

Rule 215.3(d)(2) states that "The program shall continue within standards until all students enrolled in the nursing educational program at the time of the decision to close, have graduated. In the event this is not possible, a plan shall be developed whereby students may transfer to other approved programs."

A requirement is a mandatory criterion based upon program assessment directly related to the rules that must be addressed in the manner prescribed. Please provide the plan for teach-out and closure to board staff by February 1, 2012.

It is the responsibility of the program to inform the college administration of this action.

If you have questions, please contact board staff at janice.hooper@bon.texas.gov or 512-305-6814.

Sincerely,

Kristin K. Benton, MSN, RN
Board President

Janice I. Hooper, PhD, RN
Nursing Consultant for Education

copy: THECB
Administration, Cisco College